



Jerusalem Institute of Justice

December 7, 16

Donations from Brazil to Gaza

How does international aid benefit terrorist organizations?

Presidência da República
Casa Civil
Subchefia para Assuntos Jurídicos
LEI Nº 12.292, DE 20 DE JULHO DE 2010.
Autoriza o Poder Executivo a realizar doação para a reconstrução de Gaza.
O PRESIDENTE DA REPÚBLICA Faço saber que o Congresso Nacional decreta e eu sanciono a seguinte Lei:
Art. 1º Fica o Poder Executivo autorizado a doar recursos à Autoridade Nacional Palestina, em apoio à economia palestina para a reconstrução de Gaza, no valor de até R\$ 25.000.000,00 (vinte e cinco milhões de reais).
Parágrafo único. A doação será efetivada mediante termo firmado pelo Poder Executivo, por intermédio do Ministério das Relações Exteriores, e correrá à conta de dotações orçamentárias daquela Pasta.
Art. 2º Esta Lei entra em vigor na data de sua publicação.
Brasília, 20 de julho de 2010; 189º da Independência e 122º da República.
LUIZ INÁCIO LULA DA SILVA

On July 20, 2010, president Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva sanctioned a law (number 12.292) which allows for donations of up to R\$ 25,000 000 to be transferred to Gaza by the Brazilian government¹.

Donations from Brazil to Gaza are controlled by the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA)², which is an organization that has been providing food, medicine, and social services to the Palestinian people for 67 years. Unfortunately, UNRWA has never taken steps to withhold assistance to extremist groups; and in some cases, it has cooperated openly

¹Presidência da República, Lei Nº 12.292, de 20 de Julho de 2010 (2010, July 20). *Autoriza o Poder Executivo a realizar doação para a reconstrução de Gaza*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_Ato2007-2010/2010/Lei/L12292.htm

² UNRWA (2014, July 1). *Where we work*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.unrwa.org/where-we-work/gaza-strip>



with terrorists. Now that Hamas is the ruling power in Gaza any international aid that UNRWA receives goes directly to this terrorist organization³.

UNRWA, whilst acting under the guise of an international humanitarian organization, is in fact a large Palestinian Arab organization with a smattering of foreign supervisory staff.⁴ One could easily be fooled by the blue logos and symbols of the UN but in reality Hamas has complete control over the UNRWA in Gaza. This is reflected, for example, in UNRWA schools, which promote Islamic terrorism⁵.

It is not surprising that UNRWA schools have repeatedly become flash points in conflicts between Israel and Hamas. These schools have not been taken hostage to be used as human shield as it would seem, but rather they are purposefully used as bases of recruitment and operations for Hamas⁶.

The Brazilian Government made its first donation of US\$ 960.000 to UNRWA in 2011⁷, and between 2012 and 2013 it donated more than US\$ 8 million. In addition, Brazil donated 11500 tons of rice, valued in US\$ 9.2 million in 2014⁸. The IBSA Fund, provided by the international tripartite grouping between India, Brazil and South Africa, donated US\$ 3 million to Gaza in 2014⁹. The main objective of the IBSA fund is to benefit other developing countries, particularly Least Developed Countries (LDC's) and Post Conflict Reconstruction and Development (PCRD) countries around the

³ Romirowsky, Asaf. Jewish Policy Center (2007 Fall). *How UNRWA Supports Hamas*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <https://www.jewishpolicycenter.org/2007/08/31/how-unrwa-supports-hamas/>

⁴ Greenfield, Daniel. Accuracy in Media (2014, August 7). *The UNRWA is Hamas*. Accessed September 25, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.aim.org/guest-column/the-unrwa-is-hamas/>

⁵ Kushner, Arlene. Gatestone Institute (2009, August 11). *UNRWA: It's Role in Gaza*. Accessed October 13, 2016. Retrieved from <https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/733/unrwa-its-role-in-gaza>

⁶ Ibid

⁷ UNHCR. ACNUR, Agência da ONU para Refugiados (2011, December 15). *Brasil anuncia doação de US\$ 960 mil para palestinos na Faixa de Gaza*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.acnur.org/portugues/noticias/noticia/brasil-anuncia-doacao-de-us-960-mil-para-palestinos-na-faixa-de-gaza/>

⁸ ONUBR, Nações Unidas no Brasil (2015, June 16). *Brasil participa de reunião do Comitê Consultivo da agência da ONU de assistência aos refugiados da Palestina*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <https://nacoesunidas.org/brasil-participa-de-reuniao-do-comite-consultivo-da-agencia-da-onu-de-assistencia-aos-refugiados-da-palestina/>

⁹ Blog do Itamaraty, Ministro das Relações Exteriores (2015, October 14). *Doação Brasileira à Agência das Nações Unidas de Assistência aos Refugiados da Palestina - UNRWA*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://blog.itamaraty.gov.br/25-combate-a-fome/95-doacao-brasileira-a-agencia-das-nacoes-unidas-de-assistencia-aos-refugiados-da-palestina/>



world in partnership with the UN¹⁰. In 2015, another 7 tons of rice and 4 tons of beans to the value of US\$ 5.5 million landed in Gaza, from the Brazilian's government.¹¹¹²

In just less than 5 years, Brazil has donated more than 24 million dollars to Gaza, in food and money, which goes directly to UNRWA and therefore to Hamas.

The majority of the Brazilian population is unaware that this law exists because it's sanctioning was never broadcast in the media. It would appear that the government is purposefully keeping Brazilians ignorant of this law and its consequential inflation of already high taxes.

Since Gaza is under the control of Hamas, one has to wonder whether international aid ever reaches the suffering populace it was intended for. Experience tells us that most of the funds and supplies will end up in the hands of Hamas.¹³ Former Shin Bet director Avi Dichter, now the head of the Knesset's influential Foreign Affairs and Defense Committee, said that the problem of aid organizations funneling money to Hamas is widespread, but the world remains "naive" to the pervasiveness of the problem¹⁴.

The United Nations and "enlightened countries," Dichter said, "fall into the trap set for them by Hamas and Islamic Jihad," one that "plays out year after year after year." As an example, Dichter noted that United Nations Relief and Works Agency, the agency whose sole purpose is to help Palestinian refugees, has some 30,000 clerks responsible for five million people. "It is clear that the number of UNRWA clerks who are working for Hamas is close to 100 percent," he charged¹⁵.

¹⁰ IBSA Fund. India-Brazil-South Africa Dialogue Forum. *The IBSA Facility for the Alleviation of Poverty and Hunger (IBSA Fund)*. Accessed September 27, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.ibsa-trilateral.org/about-ibsa/ibsa-fund>

¹¹ Blog do Itamaraty, Ministro das Relações Exteriores (2015, October 14). *Doação Brasileira à Agência das Nações Unidas de Assistência aos Refugiados da Palestina - UNRWA*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://blog.itamaraty.gov.br/25-combate-a-fome/95-doacao-brasileira-a-agencia-das-nacoes-unidas-de-assistencia-aos-refugiados-da-palestina/>

¹² ANBA. Brazil - Arab News Agency (2015, September 30). *Brazil to donate 1.000 tons of rice to Gaza*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www2.anba.com.br/noticia/21869161/diplomacy/brazil-to-donate-1000-tons-of-rice-to-gaza/?indice=10>

¹³ Ehrenfeld, Rachel. Forbes Magazine (2009, January 16). *Where Hamas Gets Its Money*. Accessed September 27, 2016. Retrieved from http://www.forbes.com/2009/01/16/gaza-hamas-funding-oped-cx_re_0116ehrenfeld.html

¹⁴ The tower.org Staff (2016, August 08). *UN Official: Gaza Charity's Transfer of Aid to Hamas is a "Profound Betrayal of Trust"*. Accessed September 27, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.thetower.org/3752-un-official-gaza-charitys-transfer-of-aid-to-hamas-is-a-profound-betrayal-of-trust/>

¹⁵ Ibid



According to The Israel Defense Forces, donations from the United Kingdom made to the Christian aid organization, World Vision, were used by Hamas to build one of 70 military bases that operate in Gaza. The allegations are part of the June 15, 2016 arrest of Mohammed El-Halabi, a senior World Vision worker, facing charges of funneling \$43 million in charity funds to Hamas.¹⁶

An in-depth look at Gaza will reveal UNRWA's obligation to Hamas if it wants to continue to operate in Gaza. Moreover, according to Yoni Fighel, a former Israeli military governor in the Palestinian territories, UNRWA workers are permitted to openly affiliate with terrorist groups. He notes that, "as long as UNRWA employees are members of Fatah, Hamas, or PFLP (Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine), they are going to pursue the interests of their party within the framework of their job...Who's going to check up on them to see that they don't? UNRWA? They are UNRWA." In other words, UNRWA sees Hamas and other terrorist groups as part of the Palestinian landscape, and therefore embraces these groups¹⁷.

UNRWA institutions have not just produced terrorist ideologues; they have also produced terrorist masterminds. According to Dore Gold, former Israeli ambassador to the United Nations, UNRWA has produced graduates like Ibrahim Maqadama, who "helped create the military structure of Hamas." Gold notes that, "at least 46 terrorist operatives were students in UNRWA schools." There have also been widespread reports of terrorism from UNRWA-supervised facilities, including sniper attacks from UNRWA-run schools, bomb and arms factories in UNRWA camps, the transport of terrorists to their target zones in UNRWA ambulances, and even UNRWA employees directly tied to terrorist attacks against civilians¹⁸.

As the West searches for ways to weaken Hamas in Gaza, UNRWA should be an obvious target. UNRWA provides food, medicine, economic aid, jobs, radical education, political opportunities, and even logistical assistance to Hamas and other extremist groups. UNRWA's budget, which exceeds US\$ 964 million¹⁹, is funded by many nations, including Brazil - who has donated more than US\$ 23 million in the past 4 years, however, the United States and other Western nations are the largest

¹⁶ Israel Defense Forces. IDF Blog (2016, August 8). *Aerial photo reveals Hamas misuse of international donations to Gaza*. Accessed September 27, 2016. Retrieved from <https://www.idfblog.com/blog/2016/08/08/aerial-photo-reveals-hamas-misuse-international-donations-gaza/>

¹⁷ Romirowsky, Asaf. Jewish Policy Center (2007 Fall). *How UNRWA Supports Hamas*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <https://www.jewishpolicycenter.org/2007/08/31/how-unrwa-supports-hamas/>

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ UNRWA Programme Budget 2016-2017 (2015, August). Accessed October 18, 2016. Retrieved from http://www.unrwa.org/sites/default/files/2016_2017_programme_budget_blue_book.pdf



contributors. Cutting off UNRWA's budget would be detrimental to Hamas in Gaza. It would also send an important message to the United Nations, which perpetuates the Palestinian refugee problem and lends legitimacy to groups like Hamas through UNRWA's continued existence²⁰.

In summary, the Brazilian government in an effort to help people who are genuinely suffering in Gaza has made donations to UNRWA. As seen in this report, this international aid ends up in the hands of terrorist groups because of UNRWA's association with Hamas. Brazil is therefore financing terrorists groups by supplying them with food and financial aid.

The country of Brazil has enough problems of its own, and is facing the worst economic recession in recent history. The unemployment rate shot up to 11.6%²¹ and the benchmark Selic base interest rate currently stands at 14.25% per year²². Brazil faced the impeachment of a second Republic President in a period of just 24 years, becoming the only country to have done so²³. Petrobras, the biggest oil company in Brazil, has gone bankrupt as a result of corruption involving politician and directors of the company²⁴.

Despite the years of hardship Brazil is facing, politicians are still donating precious money that the country desperately needs, to finance terrorist organizations in Gaza. It would be reasonable to assume that if the population of Brazil had known about this law, and the siphoning of their money to terrorist organizations, these donations would not have been permitted.

²⁰ Romirowsky, Asaf. Jewish Policy Center (2007 Fall). *How UNRWA Supports Hamas*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <https://www.jewishpolicycenter.org/2007/08/31/how-unrwa-supports-hamas/>

²¹ The Economist. Brazil's economy (2016, August 20). *The only way is up*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.economist.com/news/americas/21705333-recession-rages-there-are-incipient-signs-recovery-only-way-up?zid=305&ah=417bd5664dc76da5d98af4f7a640fd8a>

²² Frabasile, Daniela. *Época Negócios* (2016, September 12). *Economia brasileira vai sair da recessão, mas vai continuar semiestagnada", afirma Bresser-Pereira*. Accessed October 9, 2016. Retrieved from <http://epocanegocios.globo.com/Brasil/noticia/2016/09/economia-brasileira-vai-sair-da-recessao-mas-vai-continuar-semiestagnada-afirma-bresser-pereira.html>

²³ The Economist. Bello. (2016, September 10). *The impeachment country*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.economist.com/news/americas/21706552-does-ousting-dilma-rousseff-weaken-or-strengthen-brazils-democracy-impeachment?zid=305&ah=417bd5664dc76da5d98af4f7a640fd8a>

²⁴ The Economist. Bello. (2016, September 10). *The impeachment country*. Accessed September 26, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.economist.com/news/americas/21706552-does-ousting-dilma-rousseff-weaken-or-strengthen-brazils-democracy-impeachment?zid=305&ah=417bd5664dc76da5d98af4f7a640fd8a>